NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 522475/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

**SUMMONS** 

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK

COUNTY OF KINGS

JOHN DOE,

Plaintiff,

-against 
Plaintiff,

as place of trial.

The basis of venue is defendants' principal places of business.

CHURCH OF ST. PATRICK,

Defendants.

rejenaanis.

To the above-named defendants:

YOU ARE HEREBY SUMMONED to answer the complaint in this action and to serve a copy of your answer or, if the complaint is not served with this summons, to serve a notice of appearance, on the Plaintiff's attorneys within 20 days after the service of this summons, exclusive of the day of service (or within 30 days after the service is complete if this summons is not personally delivered to you within the State of New York), and in case your failure to appear or answer, judgement will be taken for the relief demanded herein.

A COPY OF THIS SUMMONS WAS FILED WITH THE CLERK OF THE COURT, KINGS COUNTY ON 10 11 IN COMPLIANCE WITH CPLR §§305(a) AND 306(a).

Dated: New York, New York October 11, 2019

MERSON LAW, PLLC

By:

Jordan K. Merson Attorneys for Plaintiff 150 East 58<sup>th</sup> Street 34<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, New York 10155 (212) 603-9100

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 522475/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

Defendants' Addresses:

#### DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN

310 Prospect Park West Brooklyn, New York 11215

# ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. PATRICK

9511 4th Avenue Brooklyn, NY 11209

NYSCEF DOC. NO.

INDEX NO. 522475/2019

9

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF KINGS		
JOHN DOE,		
Plaintiff,	Index No.:	_/]
-against -	VERIFIED	
DISCOURT OF PROCESSING A POST IN COMPANY	COMPLAINT	

DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN and ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. PATRICK,

Defendants.

Plaintiff<sup>1</sup>, above-named, complaining of the defendants by MERSON LAW, PLLC, respectfully alleges:

#### NATURE OF THE CLAIM

- This is a case of sexual predator, Reverend John L. Abrams ("Abrams"), being permitted 1. to sexually abuse young children at church by the Diocese of Brooklyn ("Diocese").
- Abrams was ordained for the Diocese in 1951 and was actively employed by it until his 2. retirement from 1997-2007.
- 3. Upon information and belief, during his employment with the Diocese, Abrams was transferred from Sacred Heart Catholic Church ("Sacred Heart") in Bayside, Queens to defendant Roman Catholic Church of St. Patrick ("St. Patrick") in 1982 due to his sexual abuse of minors. At Sacred Heart, upon information and belief, he also was demoted due to his sexual abuse of minors.
- Despite Abram's reputation as a sexual abuser of young children, he continued to be 4. employed by and/or under the supervision and control of the Diocese and St. Patrick's for several more years.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Plaintiff uses a pseudonym because he is a victim of a sex crime pursuant to N.Y. Civ. Rights § 50-b and other statutory and common law principles.

NYSCEF DOC. NO.

INDEX NO. 522475/2019 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

5. Indeed, Abrams remained employed by the Diocese and St. Patrick through 1988 until, in 1989, he was placed on "sick leave" and remained on such until 1997 when he retired.

- Ten years later, in 2007, Abrams was permanently barred from public ministry and 6. defrocked when an investigation into numerous claims of sexual abuse on young children against him turned up "sufficient evidence."
- 7. Abrams now appears on every compiled list of abusive priests and, upon information and belief, the Diocese has already paid out approximately \$2 million as a result of other claims of Abrams' abuse of minor children while he was at Sacred Heart and St. Patrick.
- 8. As such, upon information and belief, the Diocese knew or should have known in 1985 that Abrams sexually abused children and/or had the propensity to sexually abuse children.
- 9. Abrams' abuse of Plaintiff Mr. Doe began in or about 1985 when Mr. Doe was approximately six-years-old, and continued for approximately two years until in or about 1987 when Mr. Doe was approximately seven-years-old. Abrams sexually abused Mr. Doe between five and ten times.
- Specifically, in or about 1985, when Mr. Doe's father got sick with cancer and Mr. Doe's 10. mother was forced to spend a majority of her time taking care of Mr. Doe's father, Abrams began to manipulate a grief-stricken Mr. Doe by using his close relationship with Mr. Doe's grandmother to offer his services to "care for" and "watch over" Mr. Doe. Mr. Doe was left in Abrams' "care" for extended periods of time.
- 11. Mr. Doe's family trusted Abrams because he was a man of g-d and quite close with Mr. Doe's grandmother, but Abrams clearly betrayed that trust by molesting Mr. Doe between five and ten times over two years, including on Diocese premises.

NYSCEF DOC. NO.

INDEX NO. 522475/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

When Abrams would get Mr. Doe alone, he would touch and fondle Mr. Doe's penis with 12. one hand and masturbate with the other telling Mr. Doe that "you have to show g-d that you love him through me..."

- Mr. Doe spent decades attempting to forget about the abuse he endured at the hands of 13. Abrams, but was unable to confide in his family about the years of abuse he suffered.
- 14. Mr. Doe brings this lawsuit to recover for the emotional and physical suffering he incurred because of the negligence of the Diocese and St. Patrick's to make sure no other child is forced to suffer the abuse and physical and mental trauma he felt and continues to feel.

#### **PARTIES**

- At all times herein mentioned, defendant DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN was a not for 15. profit corporation incorporated in the State of New York and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York.
- At all times herein mentioned, defendant **DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN** was located at 16. 310 Prospect Park West, Brooklyn, New York 11215.
- At all times herein mentioned, Abrams was operating under the direction and control of 17. defendant **DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN** and its agents, servants and/or employees.
- At all times herein mentioned, Abrams was an agent, servant and/or employee of 18. defendant DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN.
- At all times herein mentioned, defendant ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. 19. **PATRICK** was a not for profit corporation incorporated in the State of New York and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York.

NYSCEF DOC. NO.

INDEX NO. 522475/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

At all times herein mentioned, defendant ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. 20. PATRICK was located at 9511 4th Avenue, Brooklyn, NY 11209

- At all times herein mentioned, Abrams was operating under the direction and control of 21. defendant ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. PATRICK and its agents, servants and/or employees.
- 22. At all times herein mentioned, Abrams was an agent, servant and/or employee of defendant ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. PATRICK.
- 23. At all times herein mentioned, defendants DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN and ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. PATRICK, were agents, servants, employees and/or alter egos of each other.

#### FACTS OF THE CASE

- Defendants DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN and ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF 24. ST. PATRICK's negligence and recklessness caused Abrams to have access to children, including on Diocese premises, despite its knowledge that Abrams sexually abused children and/or had the propensity to do so and therefore are responsible for the injuries that Plaintiff incurred because but for defendants DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN and ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. PATRICK's negligence, Plaintiff would not have suffered the mental and physical anguish inflicted by Abrams. Defendants DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN and ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. PATRICK's gross negligence, reckless, wanton and/or willful conduct warrants punitive liability.
- 25. Abrams was a reverend at St. Patrick's in Brooklyn, New York.

CLERK

INDEX NO. 522475/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019 SCEF DOC. NO.

> 26. Abrams befriended Mr. Doe's family during a difficult period in their lives in order to gain their trust so that Mr. Doe would be left alone with him for extended periods of time. Abrams would offer to "take care" of Mr. Doe while Mr. Doe's mother cared for his cancer-stricken father.

- 27. Abrams would take Mr. Doe to several facilities under the umbrella of the Diocese, such as St. Patrick's, where he would repeatedly sexually abuse him.
- 28. Abrams would force Mr. Doe to kiss him, forcibly put his hands down Mr. Doe's pants and penetrate Mr. Doe's anus with his fingers.
- Mr. Doe suffered the sexual abuse of Abrams between five and ten times over a two year 29. period on Diocese premises.
- 30. As such, Plaintiff suffered catastrophic and lifelong injuries as a result of defendants DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN and ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. **PATRICK**'s negligence in undertaking a duty to keep patrons, including young children like Mr. Doe, of its parishes safe from predators and failing to act in accord with that duty by allowing Abrams, a known predator, to continue his role and position of authority where he would continue to have the opportunity to prey on young children, and the Diocese failed to adequately supervise Abrams.
- 31. Due to defendants' unlawful conduct, Plaintiff has suffered catastrophic and lifelong injuries.

# AS AND FOR A FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION FOR NEGLIGENCE AS TO DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN

32. Plaintiff repeats, reiterates and realleges each and every allegation contained in those paragraphs of this Complaint marked and designated 1. through 31., inclusive, with the same force and effect as if hereinafter set forth at length.

CLERK

NYSCEF DOC. NO.

INDEX NO. 522475/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

At all times mentioned herein, defendant **DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN** owed a duty of care in loco parentis to keep the children of its parishes, including Plaintiff, safe from sexual abuse by its clergymen under its supervision and control, including on company premises, that ultimately befell Plaintiff, and they had a duty to supervise Abrams.

- 34. At all times mentioned herein, defendant **DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN** and/or its agents, servants and/or employees breached the above-stated duty in a negligent, reckless, willful and wanton manner, and caused Plaintiff to be sexually assaulted.
- 35. As a result of the negligence of defendant DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN and/or its agents, servants and/or employees, Plaintiff was caused serious personal injuries, emotional distress, mental pain and suffering, mental anguish and/or physical manifestations thereof, and other losses, all of which have not as of yet been ascertained.
- 36. By reason of the foregoing, Plaintiff is entitled to compensatory damages from defendants in such sums as a jury would find fair, just and adequate.
- 37. By reason of the foregoing, Plaintiff is also entitled to punitive damages from defendants in such sums as a jury would find fair, just and adequate.
- 38. The amount of damages sought exceeds the jurisdiction of all lower courts which would otherwise have jurisdiction.
- 39. This action falls within exceptions to Article 16 of the C.P.L.R.

# AS AND FOR A SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION FOR NEGLIGENCE AS TO ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. PATRICK CHURCH

40. Plaintiff repeats, reiterates and realleges each and every allegation contained in those paragraphs of this Complaint marked and designated 1. through 39., inclusive, with the same force and effect as if hereinafter set forth at length.

NYSCEF DOC. NO.

INDEX NO. 522475/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

At all times mentioned herein, defendant ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. 41. **PATRICK** owed a duty of care in loco parentis to keep the children of its parishes, including Plaintiff, safe from sexual abuse by its clergymen under its supervision and control, including on company premises, that ultimately befell the Plaintiff, and they had a duty to supervise Abrams.

- At all times mentioned herein, defendant ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. 42. **PATRICK** and/or its agents, servants and/or employees breached the above-stated duty in a negligent, reckless, willful and wanton manner, and caused Plaintiff to be sexually assaulted.
- As a result of the negligence of defendant ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. 43. **PATRICK** and/or its agents, servants and/or employees, Plaintiff was caused serious personal injuries, emotional distress, mental pain and suffering, mental anguish and/or physical manifestations thereof, and other losses, all of which have not as of yet been ascertained.
- 44. By reason of the foregoing, Plaintiff is entitled to compensatory damages from defendants in such sums as a jury would find fair, just and adequate.
- 45. By reason of the foregoing, Plaintiff is also entitled to punitive damages from defendants in such sums as a jury would find fair, just and adequate.
- 46. The amount of damages sought exceeds the jurisdiction of all lower courts which would otherwise have jurisdiction.
- 47. This action falls within exceptions to Article 16 of the C.P.L.R.

INDEX NO. 522475/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

AS AND FOR A THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION FOR NEGLIGENT HIRING, RETENTION AND SUPERVISION AS TO DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN

Plaintiff repeats, reiterates and realleges each and every allegation contained in those 48. paragraphs of this Complaint marked and designated 1. through 47., inclusive, with the same force and effect as if hereinafter set forth at length.

- 49. Defendant DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN had a duty to supervise and prevent known risks of harm to children and students of its parishes, including Plaintiff, by its clergymen.
- Defendant was negligent in hiring, retaining and supervising their personnel, such as 50. Abrams, who was careless, unskillful, negligent, reckless and acted in a willful and wanton manner in not possessing the requisite knowledge and skill of priests and church officials who should have properly been supervising the priests to ensure the safety of the children of the parishes.
- Defendant **DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN** knew or should have known Abrams sexually 51. abused and/or had the propensity to sexually abuse children and did nothing to stop it.
- 52. As a result of such negligent hiring, supervising and retention, Plaintiff was caused to suffer serious personal injuries, emotional distress, conscious pain and suffering, mental anguish and/or physical manifestations thereof, and other losses, all of which have not as of yet been ascertained.
- 53. By reason of the foregoing, Plaintiff is entitled to compensatory damages from defendants in such sums as a jury would find fair, just and adequate.
- 54. By reason of the foregoing, Plaintiff is also entitled to punitive damages from defendants in such sums as a jury would find fair, just and adequate.

NYSCEF DOC. NO.

INDEX NO. 522475/2019 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

The amount of damages sought exceeds the jurisdiction of all lower courts which would 55. otherwise have jurisdiction.

56. This action falls within exceptions to Article 16 of the C.P.L.R.

# AS AND FOR A FOURTH CAUSE OF ACTION FOR NEGLIGENT HIRING, RETENTION AND SUPERVISION AS TO ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. PATRICK

- 57. Plaintiff repeats, reiterates and realleges each and every allegation contained in those paragraphs of this Complaint marked and designated 1. through 56., inclusive, with the same force and effect as if hereinafter set forth at length.
- 58. Defendant ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. PATRICK had a duty to supervise and prevent known risks of harm to children and students of its parishes, including Plaintiff, by its clergymen.
- Defendant ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. PATRICK was negligent in 59. hiring, retaining and supervising their personnel, such as Abrams, who was careless, unskillful, negligent, reckless and acted in a willful and wanton manner in not possessing the requisite knowledge and skill of priests and church officials who should have properly been supervising the priests to ensure the safety of the children of the parishes.
- 60. Defendant ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. PATRICK knew or should have known Abrams sexually abused and/or had the propensity to sexually abuse children and did nothing to stop it.
- 61. As a result of such negligent hiring, supervising and retention, Plaintiff was caused to suffer serious personal injuries, emotional distress, conscious pain and suffering, mental anguish and/or physical manifestations thereof, and other losses, all of which have not as of yet been ascertained.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 522475/2019
RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

62. By reason of the foregoing, Plaintiff is entitled to compensatory damages from defendants in such sums as a jury would find fair, just and adequate.

- 63. By reason of the foregoing, Plaintiff is also entitled to punitive damages from defendants in such sums as a jury would find fair, just and adequate.
- 64. The amount of damages sought exceeds the jurisdiction of all lower courts which would otherwise have jurisdiction.
- 65. This action falls within exceptions to Article 16 of the C.P.L.R.

# AS AND FOR THE FIFTH CAUSE OF ACTION FOR NEGLIGENT INFLICTION OF EMOTIONAL DISTRESS AS TO DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN

- 66. Plaintiff repeats, reiterates and realleges each and every allegation contained in those paragraphs of this Complaint marked and designated 1. through 65., inclusive, with the same force and effect as if herein set forth at length.
- 67. Defendant **DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN** and their agents, servants and/or employees, knew or reasonably should have known that the failure to properly advise, supervise and hire Abrams, the priest who sexually abused Plaintiff, would and did proximately result in physical and emotional distress to Plaintiff.
- 68. Defendant DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN and their agents, servants and/or employees knew or reasonably should have known that the sexual abuse and other improper conduct would and did proximately result in physical and emotional distress to Plaintiff.
- 69. Defendant had the power, ability, authority and duty to intervene with and/or stop the improper conduct that resulted in Plaintiff being sexually abused by Abrams.
- 70. Despite said knowledge, power and duty, defendant negligently failed to act so as to stop, prevent, and prohibit the improper conduct that resulted in Abrams sexually abusing Plaintiff.

NYSCEF DOC. NO.

INDEX NO. 522475/2019 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

The amount of damages sought exceeds the jurisdiction of all lower courts which would 71. otherwise have jurisdiction.

This action falls within exceptions to Article 16 of the C.P.L.R. 72.

#### AS AND FOR THE SIXTH CAUSE OF ACTION FOR NEGLIGENT INFLICTION OF EMOTIONAL DISTRESS AS TO ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. PATRICK

- Plaintiff repeats, reiterates and realleges each and every allegation contained in those 73. paragraphs of this Complaint marked and designated 1. through 72., inclusive, with the same force and effect as if herein set forth at length.
- Defendant ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. PATRICK and their agents, 74. servants and/or employees, knew or reasonably should have known that the failure to properly advise, supervise and hire Abrams, the priest who sexually abused Plaintiff, would and did proximately result in physical and emotional distress to Plaintiff.
- 75. Defendant ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH OF ST. PATRICK and their agents, servants and/or employees knew or reasonably should have known that the sexual abuse and other improper conduct would and did proximately result in physical and emotional distress to Plaintiff.
- Defendant had the power, ability, authority and duty to intervene with and/or stop the 76. improper conduct that resulted in Plaintiff being sexually abused by Abrams.
- 77. Despite said knowledge, power and duty, defendant negligently failed to act so as to stop, prevent, and prohibit the improper conduct that resulted in Abrams sexually abusing Plaintiff.
- 78. The amount of damages sought exceeds the jurisdiction of all lower courts which would otherwise have jurisdiction.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 522475/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

79. This action falls within exceptions to Article 16 of the C.P.L.R.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff demands judgement against defendants in such sum as a jury would find fair, adequate and just.

Dated: New York, New York October 11, 2019

MERSON LAW, PLLC

By:

Jordan K. Merson Attorney for Plaintiff 150 East 58<sup>th</sup> Street 34<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, New York 10155 (212) 603-9100

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 522475/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

That he has read the within complaint and knows the contents thereof, and that the same is true to his own knowledge, except as to the matters therein stated to be alleged upon information and belief, and that as to those matters he believes it to be true;

plaintiff in the within action, hereby affirms under penalty of perjury:

That the sources of his information and knowledge are investigations and records in the file; and

That the reason this verification is made by affirm ant and not by the plaintiff is that the plaintiff is not within the County where the attorney has his office.

Dated: New York, New York October 11, 2019

JORDAN K. MERSON

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 522475/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

Index No.	Year 20	19
SUPREME COU COUNTY OF K	JRT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK JINGS	
JOHN DOE,		Melikinin manana sawat nasibidi
	Plainti <u>f</u> f,	
	- against -	
DIOCESE OF B	ROOKLYN and ROMAN CATHOLIC . PATRICK,	
	Defendants,	
SUMMO	ONS AND VERIFIED COMPLAINT	
	Merson Law, PLLC	
	Attorneys for Plaintiff	
	Office and Post Office Address, Telephone 150 East 58 <sup>th</sup> Street 34 <sup>th</sup> FI. New York, New York 10155 (212) 603-9100	
To. All Parties		Mar Maria (Lath Ad Chinacoccal) And